

The University of Dublin

Trinity College

Minutes of Board Meeting, 25 February 2009

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr J Hegarty), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Dr P J Prendergast), Senior Lecturer (Dr A Douglas), Registrar (Dr J Barkhoff), Bursar (Dr M M O'Mahony), Dr S P A Allwright, Mr P Connell, Mr W J Dowling, Ms O S Foley, Mr R Hodson, Dr E Mac Cárthaigh, Dr A McElligott, Dr J F McGilp, Dr K J McGinley, Ms P Murphy, Dr E J O'Halpin, Dr D O'Neill, Dr A J Piesse, Mr C Reilly, Dr H J Rice, Dr S M Ryan, Dr D M Singleton, Mr H Sullivan, Mr B Sweeney, Dr J K Vij, Dr K Walshe.
<i>Apologies</i>	Ms G Clarke.
<i>In attendance</i>	Ms S Mac Bride.
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Acting Secretary, Treasurer (Acting).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer.
	Mr P Mangan, Director of Buildings for BD/08-09/154 (ii).

SECTION A

- BD/08-09/148 Minutes** The minutes of the meeting held on 28 January 2009 were approved and signed subject to the inclusion of Dr Piesse on the list of those present.
- BD/08-09/149 Matters Arising from the Minutes** A number of matters arising from the minutes were discussed and have been recorded below, (see minutes BD/08-09/150, 151, 152 and 153 below).
- BD/08-09/150 Proposals for future collaboration (see minute BD/08-09/121(i) of 28 January 2009)** The Provost advised Board that discussions were ongoing with UCD and clarified that a merger of the institutions was not being considered.
- BD/08-09/151 Statutes Review - Process by which the Provost is chosen by the College (see minute BD/08-09/123 of 28 January 2009)** In response to a query, the Provost advised Board that the Sub-Group of Board, established to prepare proposals on the technical operation of the combined approach to choosing the next Provost, had commenced its work. He stated that the issues which need to be addressed from a statutory perspective, as outlined in a paper prepared by Dr O'Dell, Chair of the Statutes Review Working Party, were being considered in detail by the Sub-Group and that Dr O'Dell would be attending its next meeting. The Board, noting the urgency of bringing the process to a conclusion by the end of this academic year, including securing the assent of the Fellows to all statutory changes, also noted that the Sub-Group's proposals will be presented to it for approval.
- BD/08-09/152 Disciplinary Procedures - Membership of Working Party to review Disciplinary Procedures (see minute BD/08-09/139 of 28 January 2009)** The Registrar,

confirming that the remit of the Working Party was limited to the disciplinary procedures for academic staff, invited Board's attention to the appointment of the following representative members to the Working Party:

Board Representative	Professor E O'Halpin
IFUT Representative	Professor C Ó Cuilleaináin
Fellows' Representative	Professor J Parnell

The Register advised Board that the decision to review staff disciplinary procedures had been taken in 2007 (see minute BD/07-08/045(ii) of 24 October 2007) and that all proposals prepared by the Working Group would be presented to Board for approval.

BD/08-09/153 New Academic Year Structure (see minute BD/08-09/121(iii) of 28 January 2009)

The Board noted comments from a number of Board members about the lack of engagement and negotiation with Trade Unions on the implementation of the new Academic Year Structure, noting in particular, the impact of the new arrangements on the annual leave year in some areas. Dr Rice, Chair of the Personnel and Appointments Committee (PAC), advised Board that a policy in relation to annual leave had been considered at the previous PAC meeting and would be reported to Board in due course through the Committee's minutes.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that in accordance with the decision of the Fellows when giving their assent to the Statutory changes, engagement would continue with staff representative groups to resolve all issues in advance of the introduction of the New Academic Year Structure in 2009/2010. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer also stated that any specific issues affecting staff should be referred to the Staff Office for further discussion. The Board noted that it would receive regular reports on the progress of the discussions.

BD/08-09/154 Provost's Report The Provost invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- (i) **Steering Group for a New National Higher Education Strategy** The Provost advised Board that he had accepted an invitation from the Government to sit on the Steering Group for a New National Higher Education Strategy in a non-representative capacity.
- (ii) **Property Matter** The Director of Buildings, present by invitation, advised Board of the acute lack of space for College's core activities and the problems that this is causing for academic areas, particularly in the Faculty of Arts, Humanities and Social Sciences. He advised Board that he and his staff, together with the College's property advisors, had conducted a thorough review of properties in an effort to meet the College's needs, the conclusion of which was that, in the current financial climate, there was an overwhelming argument in favour of purchasing a suitable property rather than renting. He invited Board's attention to detailed proposals for the purchase of a specific property which would meet the College's needs in this regard. In the course of a discussion, the Director of Buildings and the Treasurer (Acting) clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members. The Board agreed to the purchase of the building on the terms outlined.

BD/08-09/155 Funding Group The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the Report of the Funding Group, dated 23 January 2009, which had been circulated. In outlining the objectives of the Funding Group, its membership and terms of reference, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised Board that the Funding Group had benefited from the new College structure and the new roles of Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, Chief Operating Officer and Faculty Deans.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer invited Board's attention to the following aspects of the Report:

- (a) the basis of the data collection along with income and expenditure projections for the period 2009-2013;
- (b) analysis of Faculty/Non-Faculty balances;
- (c) ancillary activities under the control of the Chief Operating Officer;
- (d) proposed savings to be implemented in 2009;
- (e) scenario planning and income and expenditure simulations;
- (f) linking scenario planning with academic activity at School level through the approved Resource Planning Model.

In the course of a discussion, Board members raised the following issues:

- (i) the university sector should be doing more to highlight the adverse effect that the reduction in government funding is having on the accessibility to third level education and to counter the public perception that the third level sector is unaffected by the current financial difficulties;
- (ii) the impact of proposed savings should be communicated to the staff who are directly affected;
- (iii) all income and expenditure, including expenditure on traditional College activities, will have to be examined from a strategic point of view;
- (iv) in order to manage the current financial crisis, there is a need for multi-annual budgeting and for early notification of budgets from the HEA;
- (v) a risk assessment of the proposals should be embedded in the report;
- (vi) proposals should focus on projections for 2010 given the rate of change in the economic climate.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Treasurer (Acting) clarified a number of technical issues raised by Board members, noting that the recommendations of the Funding Group had been endorsed by the Finance Committee on 6 February 2009 (see minute FN/08-09/41 of 6 February 2009).

The Board approved the recommendations presented in Section 11 of the Report from the Funding Group, noting that the proposals from the Dean of Graduate Studies in relation to postgraduate fee levels will require further consideration by the Funding Group and the Finance Committee and will be considered by Board in due course.

BD/08-09/156 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure The Treasurer (Acting), introducing the topic, invited Board's attention to the memorandum, dated 17 February 2009, which had been circulated containing:

- (i) HEA recurrent grant allocation letter dated 19 December 2008 along with accompanying tables;
- (ii) Basis of Preparation of 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure;
- (iii) Executive Officers' minute of meeting on 27 January 2009;
- (iv) 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure with explanatory notes;
- (v) 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure set out in the HEA format;
- (vi) 2010 High Level Estimates of Income and Expenditure including and excluding Research;
- (vii) Draft letter from the Provost, on behalf of the College, to the HEA under the Framework for Borrowing and Loan Guarantees;
- (viii) Draft letter from the Provost, on behalf of the College, to the HEA in accordance with S.37(5) of the Universities Act 1997.

Noting that the 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure had been considered by the Executive Officers Group on 27 January 2009 and by the Finance Committee on 6 February 2009 (see minute FN/08-09/42 of 6 February 2009), the Treasurer (Acting) invited Board's attention to the following issues:

- (a) the core recurrent grant for the sector in 2009 represents a decrease of 6.5% over the outturn of 2008;

- (b) the core recurrent grant to College for 2009 amounted to €88.3m which represents a decrease of 7.5% over 2008 as determined by the HEA RGAM following the application of the moderating mechanism;
- (c) the HEA has indicated that institutions may increase the student charge for 2009/2010 by €600 to €1,500 per student.

The Board considered the 2009 Income and Expenditure Estimates as circulated, noting the projected deficit of €6.2m after making provision for the Protection of Employees (Fixed Term Work) Act, 2003 (FTWA) and a contingency fund to meet possible unforeseen/unplanned expenditure requirements before the year-end. The Treasurer (Acting) advised Board that pending the resolution of the negotiations with the HEA in relation to the FTWA, the College should continue to make provision for this liability.

The Treasurer (Acting) invited the Board's attention to the High Level Estimated Outturn for 2010 which, having been based on certain assumptions in regard to projected income and pay and non-pay expenditure, identified a recurrent deficit in the order of €10.2m after provision for FTWA liabilities. In response to a query, the Treasurer clarified that the Estimates include provisions for all agreed pay awards as notified by the HEA.

The President of the Students' Union, acknowledging the assistance from the Treasurer's Office in advance of the meeting, invited Board's attention to the Students' Union's concerns about the lack of discussion on the level of increase in the student charge and its allocation before the 2009 Estimates were presented to Board for approval. He stated that it was the view of the Students' Union that in the absence of any clear direction from the HEA to the contrary, the income from this charge should be allocated exclusively to student services and not be used in part to alleviate the College's deficit. In response to a query from the President of the Students' Union, the Provost advised that the time-scale for submission of the 2009 Estimates to the HEA precluded any changes being made to the Estimates after the meeting.

In the course of a discussion, a number of Board members stated that the manner of increasing the student charge for 2009 was tantamount to the introduction of tuition fees and expressed their dissatisfaction at the manner in which this was being done. It was agreed that there would be further discussion on this matter at a future meeting.

Noting that the treatment of the increased student charge is a sectoral issue, the Board agreed that its concerns should be communicated to the HEA and the IUA. The Board also noted comments that, in order to support diversification among students, more funding should be allocated to student services.

The Board noted, and where appropriate approved:

- (i) the reduction in grant of 7.5% over 2008 as determined by RGAM, with the moderating factor being applied;
- (ii) the 2009 Estimates of Income and Expenditure;
- (iii) the high level estimated outturn for 2010;
- (iv) the increase the student service charge for 2009/2010 by €600 to €1,500 per student;
- (v) the content of the draft letter to the HEA from the Provost under the Framework for Borrowing and Loan Guarantees for 2007/2008;
- (vi) the content of the draft letter to the HEA in accordance with Section 37 (5) of the Universities Act, advising of the planned deficit for 2009.

The Board noted the Students' Unions Representatives' dissent.

The Provost thanked the Treasurer (Acting) and his staff.

BD/08-09/157 University Council The Board confirmed the Acta of the University Council from its meeting held on 11 February 2009 subject to further comments covering CL/08-09/093 (i), 095, 096, 097, 102 and 103 (Items from Section D in the Acta are set out in Section D of these minutes).

BD/08-09/158 Graduate Studies Matter (see Actum CL/08-09/093 (i) of 11 February 2009) The Board confirmed the decision of the University Council in the matter brought before it concerning the appeal of a postgraduate student.

BD/08-09/159 Ad Hoc Appeals Committee Under Other Business, the Board noted and approved the outcomes of the *Ad Hoc* Appeals Committee which had investigated appeals against six decisions of the Senior Promotions Committee 2008 as set out in a memorandum from the Senior Dean, tabled dated 19 February 2009.

BD/08-09/160 Foundation Scholarship Examinations - Pharmacy Under Other Business, the Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer dated 24 February 2009, which had been tabled.

BD/08-09/161 Foundation Scholarship Examinations - Human Genetics Under Other Business, the Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Senior Lecturer dated 24 February 2009, which had been tabled.

BD/08-09/162 Pro-Junior Dean Under Other Business, the Board approved the appointment of Mr B Tangney as Pro-Junior Dean to investigate a complaint against a named student.

SECTION B

BD/08-09/163 Finance Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Finance Committee from its meeting of 6 February 2009.

BD/08-09/164 Information Policy Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/096 of 11 February 2009) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Information Policy Committee from its meeting of 2 December 2008.

Dr O'Halpin, Chair of the Information Policy Committee, advised Board that the Committee, at its meeting on 24 February 2009, had agreed a course of action to address the high level risk associated with IT disaster recovery. The Board noted that this would be recorded in the minutes of the Committee meeting which would be presented to Board in due course.

BD/08-09/165 Research Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/097 of 11 February 2009) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Research Committee from its meetings of 29 January 2009.

BD/08-09/166 Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Site and Facilities Committee from its meetings of 10 February 2009 and 19 February 2009.

BD/08-09/167 Student Services Committee (see Actum CL/08-09/095 of 11 February 2009) The Board noted, and where a decision was required, approved proposals in the draft minutes of the Student Services Committee from its meetings of 25 November 2008 and 20 January 2009 with particular reference to:

SS/08-09/32 of 25 November 2008 - Student demographics, future planning The Welfare Officer of the Students' Union advised Board that an increase in students from non-traditional backgrounds has placed increased strain on College's Health Services and on the services offered by the Students' Union Welfare Office.

SS/08-09/33 of 25 November 2008 - Financial Assistance Committee Annual Report 2007-08 The Welfare Officer of the Students' Union advised Board that the (European Social Fund) Student Assistance Fund was expected to be cut by 21%, while the number of students seeking financial assistance has increased significantly, placing a huge strain on the funding available.

SECTION C

BD/08-09/168 Higher Degrees The Board noted Higher Degrees, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on:
(i) 28 January 2009;
(ii) 11 February 2009.

BD/08-09/169 Proctors' Lists for Spring Commencements The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 10 February 2009.

BD/08-09/170 Visual and Performing Arts Fund The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Provost, circulated, dated 27 January 2009.

BD/08-09/171 Trinity Ball 2009 The Board noted and approved the request of the committee to hold the Trinity Ball on Friday 8 May 2009.

BD/08-09/172 Principal Committee - Site and Facilities Committee The Board noted and approved the nomination of Mr P Connell (elected Board member) as a member of this committee.

BD/08-09/173 Statutes - Chapter XVII - Statute relating to the Academic Year, the terms and the Vacations, sections 1, 2 and 3 The Board noted that following the written assent of a majority of the Fellows, the Visitors had approved the change in the Statutes relating to the academic year.

BD/08-09/174 Scholarship - Request to Intermit The Board noted and approved the request of the Senior Lecturer that two non-Foundation Scholars (03300471 and 03475042) be permitted to intermit for a second year in the academic year 2008-2009 having previously intermitted in 2007-2008.

Under Other Business

The Board approved the request of the Senior Lecturer, tabled dated 24 February 2009 in respect of requests from the following Foundation and Non-Foundation Scholars for intermission specified in each case:

- (i) 02024985 – 2007-2008 (previously intermitted in 2006-2007);
- (ii) 03912281 – 2008-2009 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (iii) 03493440 – 2008-2009 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (iv) 03912281 – 2008-2009 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (v) 03450767 – 2008-2009 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (vi) 03307280 – 2009-2010 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008 and 2008-2009);
- (vii) 03900657 – 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (viii) 01626621 – 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 (previously intermitted in 2007-2008);
- (ix) 01446886 – 2008-2009 and possibly 2009-2010 (previously intermitted in 2005-2006, 2006-2007 and 2007-2008);
- (x) 99560712 – 2005-2006, 2006-2007 and 2007-2008 (retrospective);
- (xi) 01337637/07146736 – 2005-2006, 2006-2007 and 2007-2008 (retrospective);
- (xii) 99295296/07146302 – 2007-2008 (previously intermitted in 2006-2007) (retrospective);
- (xiii) 01911309/06135757 – 2006-2007 and 2007-2008 (retrospective) (previously intermitted in 2003-2004).

BD/08-09/175 National Institute for Intellectual Disability - Memoranda of Understanding - Dundalk Institute of Technology and University College Cork The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Director, circulated, dated 17 February 2009 and memoranda of understanding with the Dundalk Institute of Technology and University College Cork.

BD/08-09/176 Degree of Master in Theology (M.Th.) The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Registrar, tabled dated 25 February 2009.

BD/08-09/177 Revised Calendar Entries - Ekenhead Scholarship/Amendments to Prizes The Board noted and approved memoranda from the Treasurer (Acting), circulated, dated 17 February 2009.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

The following items were deferred:

Research Matters
Trinity Academic Medicine Centre

Signed:

Date: