



Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

Minutes of Board Meeting of 27 April 2016

<i>Present</i>	Provost (Dr P J Prendergast)(in the Chair), Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer (Professor L Hogan), Bursar (Professor V Campbell), Registrar (Professor S P A Allwright), Senior Lecturer/Dean of Undergraduate Studies (Professor G Martin), Dr O Braiden, Mr C Clancy, Mr F Cowzer, Ms K Crowther, Professor S Draper, Professor E Drew, Ms S Dunphy, Mr D Frost, Mr G J Garrahan, Professor R Gilligan, Ms M Kenny, Mr T Keohane, Professor B Lucey, Professor C McCabe, Professor J F McGilp, Professor C O'Farrelly, Professor D O'Neill, Professor D R Phelan, Ms L Ruane, Professor A Seery, Professor M Ó Siochrú.
<i>Apologies</i>	Professor W J Dowling.
<i>In attendance</i>	Assistant Secretary to the College (Acting) (Ms Sandra Kavanagh).
<i>(ex officio)</i>	Secretary to the College (Mr John Coman), Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer (Mr Ian Mathews).
<i>(by invitation)</i>	Chief Operating Officer (Ms Geraldine Ruane), Vice-President for Global Relations (Professor J Hussey).

SECTION A

BD/15-16/237	Statement of Interest The Provost requested Board members to declare any potential conflict of interest they may have in relation to items on the Board agenda. There were no statements of interest noted.
BD/15-16/238	Minutes - Meeting of 23 March 2016 The following corrections to the draft minutes of the Board meeting of 23 March 2016 were noted and the minutes were approved as amended: BD/15-16/227 Human Resources Committee The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of meeting of the Human Resources Committee of 11 February 2016. The Board noted the arrangements for Contracts for Professional, Administrative and Support staff for the academic year 2015/16 as outlined in minute HRC/15-16/13.
BD/15-16/239	Matters Arising from the Minutes The following items were raised under matters arising: BD/15-16/210 Guidelines on noting large research projects at Board Professor McGilp raised the point that the cumulative risk resulting from multiple large research projects is addressed in the Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16, which would be discussed later in the meeting. Professor McGilp informed the Board that the Minutes of the Audit Committee of 15 March 2016, which would be discussed later in the meeting, emphasises the need for active risk monitoring and updating of risks and actions in the High-Level Risk Register appear not to have been updated for some time.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer and the Chief Operating Officer both responded that cumulative risk is currently addressed through the Executive Officers Group, and by its sub-Committee, the Risk Management Group.

BD/15-16/198 (BD/15-16/195) Appeals Process for the decisions of the Review Committees for Administrative, Professional and Support Staff

The Registrar informed the Board that the Review Committee for Administrative, Professional and Support Staff met on 13 April 2016.

BD/15-16/198 (BD/14-15/170 and BD/14-15/128) Quality – Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services

At the suggestion of a Board member, it was agreed that the Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services (Item C.28) would be discussed in Section A of the Agenda.

BD/15-16/198 (BD/15-16/174) Planning Group Report No. 14

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that Planning Group has agreed a number of proposals to achieve the Board-mandated balanced operational budget. The Annual Budgetary Cycle (ABC) meetings with Schools will be held in the coming weeks. An update will be provided in Planning Group Report No. 15, to be presented at the Board meeting of 22 June.

BD/15-16/240

Provost's Report

The Provost provided the Board with an update on the following:

(i) Expert Group on Future Funding for Higher Education

The Provost informed the Board that it still appeared that the findings of the report of the Expert Group on Future Funding for Higher Education would not be addressed prior to the formation of a new Government and the appointment of a new Minister for Education and Skills. The Provost had been happy to provide a venue for the ongoing talks regarding Government formation between Fine Gael and Fianna Fáil in the Provost's House and in the Trinity Biomedical Sciences Institute facility.

(ii) Fossil fuel divestment

The Provost, along with some College Officers and Board members, met with members of the student-led fossil fuel divestment group. The Investment Committee will assess the impact of the proposals on the value of the endowment, and it will then be forwarded for consideration by the Finance Committee.

The Provost informed the Board that he would like to see College taking further steps towards becoming a low-carbon sustainable campus.

(iii) Trinity Education Project (TEP)

The Provost informed the Board that the Trinity Education Project (TEP) was proceeding well under the leadership of the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer. The Provost has already spoken with a number of groups in relation to the graduate attributes and will address further groups in the coming months. The Provost informed the Board that graduate attributes of a Trinity student will be delivered through a combination of academic curricula and co-curricular activities.

In response to an invitation from the Provost, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the University Council is expected to make a number of institution-wide decisions on key elements of the TEP by the end of this academic year.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer advised that the new curriculum architecture proposals for undergraduate programmes, currently being finalised under the remit of the

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

TEP, will reduce the number of denominated entry routes significantly as undertaken by Trinity in the Compact with the HEA.

The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer informed the Board that the TEP is also considering a new framework for assessment that will both test the full spectrum of graduate attributes and address the finding of over-assessment that is included in a number of School and Programme reviews.

(iv) 1916 event at the University of Liverpool's London campus

The Provost informed the Board that, as part of the Decade of Commemorations programme, he Chaired a very successful 1916 Rising commemoration event at the University of Liverpool's London campus, attended by the Irish Ambassador to the UK, His Excellency Dan Mulhall, and the Vice-Chancellor of the University of Liverpool.

(v) Trinity Creative Challenge

The Provost informed the Board that five projects were successfully completed under the Trinity Creative Challenge:

- Enda Bates: *From Within, From Without* (spatial music performance, Public Theatre, 8 April 2016);
- Fiona Hallinan and Kate Strain: *The First International Conference of Ultimology* (Trinity Long Room Hub, 14 April 2016);
- Grace Weir: *A Reflection on Light* (screening with live musical accompaniment and reflections on Mainie Jellett by her nephew D. Michael Purser and curated exhibition with Dr. Yvonne Scott, in the School of Physics, 14-15 April 2016);
- Pan Pan Theatre: *Cascando* (radio play – sound installation theatre piece, Samuel Beckett Theatre, 19-23 April 2016);
- Declan Clarke: *The Hopeless End of a Great Dream* (film shot entirely in Trinity College Dublin, screened on campus 20 April 2016, on exhibition in Temple Bar Gallery + Studios 21 April – 18 June 2016).

(vi) Inauguration of two new Pro-Chancellors of Trinity College Dublin

The Provost informed the Board that Professor Jane Grimson and Professor David McConnell were inaugurated as new Pro-Chancellors of Trinity College Dublin, the University of Dublin.

(vii) Discussions with the Lady Margaret Hall regarding replicating the Trinity Access Programme (TAP)

The Provost informed the Board that discussions were held with Lady Margaret Hall, University of Oxford, with a view to replicating the Trinity Access Programme (TAP). The Provost had also engaged in two days of successful fundraising campaigning in the UK afterwards.

(viii) Campaign for Trinity

The Provost updated the Board on the fundraising Campaign for Trinity, stating that the Campaign Cabinet meet monthly to assess potential projects. The More Partnership report, which will shape the campaign, is due before the Campaign Cabinet in May. Projects will then be invited to pitch their case to the Campaign Cabinet. The Provost expects a private launch of the Trinity Campaign in September 2016.

(ix) Seanad Éireann election

The Provost provided an update on the ballot count for the Seanad Éireann election, which was ongoing in the Public Theatre, with Senator David Norris being already elected having exceeding the quota on the first count.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Provost stated that student experience proposals are eligible to pitch to the Campaign for Trinity Cabinet, but that student services would not be likely to be funded by donors. In response to a query from a Board member,

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

the Provost informed the Board that Faculty fundraising concepts should come through the relevant Faculty Dean to the Campaign Cabinet for consideration.

In response to several comments from Board members regarding the progress of the TEP, the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer stated that:

- Of the two Academic Year structure options currently under consideration, both would result in an increase in the number of weeks allocated to research;
- The TEP will address proposals to strip out any complex progression rules, enhancing the Trinity experience for both students and staff;
- Moral and ethical considerations underpin the proposed overarching graduate attributes.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Secretary to the College stated that a 'lessons learned' exercise, with a view to ensuring that the Seanad Éireann count was as efficient as possible, would be scheduled after the current ballot was complete.

In response to a suggestion from a Board member, the Provost will consider how best to engage with the newly elected University of Dublin (Trinity College) Senators to address issues of concern to Trinity.

BD/15-16/241

Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16

The Provost welcomed Ms Julie O'Neill, Chair of the Audit Committee, and Mr Francis Sheeran, Internal Auditor, who joined the meeting for this item.

Ms O'Neill highlighted the following from the Report from the Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16, as circulated:

- The report recognises the context of very difficult financial constraints including reduced State funding, a competitive global situation, the rapid pace of change in the internal and external higher education environment and the importance of achieving successful delivery of Trinity's strategic objectives. The first part of the report is a high level commentary by the Committee on issues which it wishes in particular to draw to the Board's attention. Recognising the ambitious targets of the College, the Committee focussed this year's report on the governance and capacity to deliver arrangements which one would expect in similar organisations driving out major strategies and on how Trinity compares. The report sets out a number of areas for attention where Trinity is operating at a disadvantage in trying to achieve its mission and which, if addressed, would improve its ability to achieve its objectives;
- Any lapses in governance of Trinity will be judged through a public service lens and even if relatively minor have the capacity to endanger the autonomy enjoyed by the university or impede the good work to date;
- The dual function of the Provost as Chair of the Board and Chief Officer makes for a difficult role;
- The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer plays an overarching role in an organisation, and this role should be clarified within Trinity to empower the Financial Services Division to fully function;
- The role of the Chief Risk Officer is not fully articulated;
- Much work has been done on the risk management system and it needs to be more fully developed, embedded and utilised in an effective way at College operating levels;
- Trinity has invested in a number of strategic initiatives, which need strong governance to ensure they remain on track. The report highlights a concern that the risk management system is not fully capturing the cumulative risks of the large scale strategic projects;
- The High-Level Register needs to be updated more often, and the risks articulated better;
- The Board should define the level of risk it is willing to accept;
- The systems of Internal Control, including checks and balances, should be strengthened;
- Monitoring and reporting systems need to be strengthened;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- The report highlights a concern that HR, Finance and Risk capacity may be insufficient to meet some requirements of the Strategic Plan. The report proposes that although skills may be brought in, input from Trinity staff will still be required to oversee and control them.

The Provost, and several members of the Board, thanked Ms O'Neill, the Audit Committee and the Internal Audit team for their hard work in producing the report.

The following comments from the Board members were noted:

- The dual role of the Provost and the size and composition of Board were discussed at length. The current Board composition may not be suitable for a modern institution. A Board with a smaller number of permanent members can function efficiently by inviting experts and interested parties to have input into specific agenda items;
- The appointment of a Chief Risk Officer should be considered, as it would help drive and embed risk management throughout the organisation;
- A lack of data in key areas can hinder good governance;
- The dual role of the Provost had been reviewed in recent years by a Board Working Group;
- Responsibility for identified risks and for Audit Committee actions should be assigned to individuals rather than groups or units in order to increase accountability;
- Increasing staff retention, conducting exit interviews and proper knowledge transfer would reduce the staff capacity risk across College;
- Focussing on re-structuring HR/Finance/Risk systems and defining the relationship between the Board and the Executive Officers would build accountability;
- The student body queried reducing their representation on the Board;
- In light of the concerns raised by the Audit Committee regarding the cumulative risks of large strategic projects, the timing of any project to look into the composition of the Board should be considered carefully.

Ms O'Neill stated that the backlog of outstanding audit recommendations would be eased if every project was assigned to a single person with responsibility for delivery.

Ms O'Neill stated that a Board with a large number of permanent members can prove unwieldy and, if the requisite expertise is not available within College, a smaller Board structure with an increased representation from outside the university may work effectively.

Ms O'Neill stated that, although it is best international practise, it is not essential to split the dual role of the Provost. However, if the role is to remain unchanged, additional consideration needs to be given to how best to ensure that the required checks and balances are in place. Ms O'Neill stressed that the goal is the effective management of the administrative and academic streams and that clearly assigning responsibilities for actions would contribute more to this aim than a restructuring of the Provost's role.

Ms O'Neill thanked the Head of Internal Audit, Mr Francis Sheeran, his small team of Internal Audit staff, Ms Moya Thompson who provides secretarial support and the members of the Audit Committee for their dedication and efforts throughout the year.

The Provost noted the Board members' support for considering a change to governance structures, but pointed out that increased accountability and collegiality do not necessarily align. The Provost proposed a preliminary scoping exercise to look the governance structures within College, with a remit to include the dual role of the Provost and a Board membership not necessarily based on representation. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer supported the scoping exercise, but reminded the Board that external and strategic programmes may need to take precedence. The Board agreed to this scoping proposal.

The Provost informed the Board that the Executive Officers' reply to the Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16 will contain commentary on the issues raised, including the dual role of the Provost.

The Board noted and approved the Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16.

Ms O'Neill and Mr Sheeran left the meeting at this point.

BD/15-16/242

Guidelines for the Allocation of Staff Residential Accommodation and Office Space

The Provost welcomed Professor Brian McGing, Senior Dean, who joined the meeting for this item.

The Registrar presented the Guidelines for the Allocation of Staff Residential Accommodation and Office Space, as circulated, reminding the Board that although the Provost retains oversight of the allocation of rooms and other space in College, responsibility for staff allocation is delegated to the Senior Dean.

In 2015, the Staff Accommodation Working Group was mandated by the Board to assess both the current use of residential and office accommodation and the statutory provisions with regard to Fellows' rights in order to develop a set of guiding principles to assist the Senior Dean in prioritising space requests. This request was in response to static or decreasing office space and an increasing number of Fellows.

The resultant guidelines, as circulated, include:

- Recommendations for assigning office space to retired staff;
- Recommendations and a recommended priority for assigning residential accommodation to staff; and
- Recommendations as to rent to be charged for residential accommodation assigned to the different categories of Fellows and Fellows *emeriti*.

The Senior Dean informed the Board that College will endeavour to provide a communal working area for Fellows *Emeriti* with hot-desking space, on-line facilities and storage lockers. In certain circumstances, where Fellows *Emeriti* are engaged in substantial leadership roles that will substantially contribute to the College mission in the areas of research and/or teaching, the Senior Dean may choose to assign a designated office/desk space, where available, for up to three years initially, with the possibility of a renewal for a maximum of three further years upon submission of a brief report to the Senior Dean. The Senior Dean pointed out that office space is not a statutory right for Fellows *Emeriti* but rather a benefit granted by the Board.

The Senior Dean informed the Board that residential accommodation will be prioritised to Fellows who give a written declaration stating that they intend to make College their primary or main residence. The Senior Dean recommended to the Board that some space be made available for new staff members and for Visiting Scholars. It was noted that Fellows and Fellows *emeriti* who pay rent at less than standard rate for residential accommodation are personally responsible for any benefit-in-kind liability which may arise.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar confirmed that Trinity Hall has previously had residential units for staff. A Board member stated that College should facilitate retiring staff who wish to continue working, while being realistic regarding space constraints.

In response to a Board member who stated that offering individual office space to Fellow *Emeriti* for a maximum of six years may be seen as unfair, as some retired members of staff continue to teach and making a valuable contribution to College beyond this time, the Senior Dean reminded Board that office space is not a statutory right for Fellows *Emeriti*. The point

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

was made that where retired staff are continuing to provide research or teaching to their Disciplines, the Department or School should try to provide office accommodation.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Registrar will investigate if staff have rights under property law.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 16 March 2016, from the Registrar, Chair of the Staff Accommodation Working Group, and the accompanying Guidelines for the Allocation of Staff Residential Accommodation and Office Space.

The Board noted the dissent of Professor Eileen Drew to the proposal.

Professor McGing left the meeting at this point.

BD/15-16/243

College Risk Register – Objectives and High Level Approach for Phase II

The Chief Operating Officer introduced her memorandum, dated 15 March 2016, as circulated.

The Chief Operating Officer informed the Board that Phase 1 of the College Risk Register project, which focused on the nine Strategic Goals of the Strategic Plan 2014-2019, is complete. The Chief Operating Officer requested the Board to approve Phase II of the project which will consist of the implementation of risk management across the College, covering operational risks relating to the delivery of the strategic plan and building on the risk register developed in Phase I. The Risk Management Group (RMG) has already approved this transition to Phase II.

The approach proposed in the circulated document was initially piloted in three areas (Corporate Services Division (HR and ISS), Financial Services Division and Academic Services Division (the Library)), with additional pilots in three Schools and Trinity Research and Innovation due to be completed by the end of June 2016. The Chief Operating Officer highlighted to the Board some key elements of the proposed year-long Phase II project, including an evaluation of lessons learned during the pilot stage, appropriate training for administrative heads and managers and project governance through the oversight of the RMG, the Executive Officers Group and the Board.

The Chief Operating Officer informed the Board that she feels the nature of the role of Chief Risk Officer may not be compatible with her role as Chief Operating Officer, and feels ultimate responsibility for risk management creates a potential conflict of interest. The Chief Operating Officer informed the Board that Phase II would benefit from a dedicated Chief Risk Officer to lead the project and would lead to tighter governance of the project. The Chief Operating Officer suggested Board's approval for the RMG to be chaired by an extern.

Professor McGilp drew the Board's attention to Audit Committee Minute AD/15-16/43 Risk Management, which emphasises the need for active risk auditing of university-level risks in parallel to the work on Phase II, the resourcing of the role of Chief Risk Officer and an external RMG Chair. Professor McGilp also informed the Board that the Audit Committee noted concerns that the updating of the risk register does not involve the RMG and that College has not issued a clear statement regarding risk appetite.

The following comments from Board members were noted:

- The memorandum was welcomed as timely and valuable;
- The report should be linked to other strategic reports, such as the Estates Review compiled by Turnberry Consulting Limited;
- Many high-level risks are financially dependent, and the Board should be mindful of these;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- The risks should be assigned to individuals rather than groups or units, to increase accountability;
- Assigning a dedicated Chief Risk Officer is essential to capture cross-over and unexpected risks;
- The role of Chief Risk Officer should include a corporate responsibility function;
- The Risk Register should capture operational and human failures.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 15 March 2016, from the Chief Operating Officer, regarding the College Risk Register (Objectives and High Level Approach for Phase II).

The Chief Operating Officer will present the amended risk register, with responsibility for specific risks generally assigned to a person and not to a group or unit, for noting at the Board meeting of 22 June 2016.

The Board agreed to the proposal from the Chief Operating Officer that the RMG be chaired by an extern. The Chief Operating Officer will present the staffing case for a Chief Risk Officer to the Executive Officers Group.

BD/15-16/244 Thapar University Partnership - Engineering, Computer Science and Trinity Teaching & Learning

The Vice-President for Global Relations invited the Board's attention to her memorandum, dated 20 April 2016, which had been circulated.

The Vice-President for Global Relations informed the Board that the partnership proposal is the result of extensive negotiations with Thapar University and that the proposal is to be presented for review and approval at the Finance Committee meeting of the 7 May 2016.

The Vice-President for Global Relations provided the Board with background to the partnership proposal, informing the Board that Trinity signed an MOU with Thapar University in November 2011 and signed a Heads of Agreement in June 2015. The partnership proposal, as circulated, is solely relating to Engineering, Computer Science and Trinity Teaching & Learning. It is hoped to extend the agreement to other Schools in due course.

The Vice-President for Global Relations highlighted the benefits of the proposal, in particular that it meets the objectives of the Global Relations Strategy, will boost Trinity's profile in India, relevant Schools will benefit from increased non-EU student numbers and that two full Trinity Professor posts will be established (one in each of the Schools of Engineering and Computer Science & Statistics) strengthening international research collaborations.

The Vice-President for Global Relations drew the Board's attention to the following details of the partnership agreement:

- As per the Articulation Agreement signed in June 2015, the partnership is a 2+2 programme that will see Thapar students attend Sophister years in Trinity;
- The first cohort will join in 2017-18, with the last cohort graduating in 2024-25;
- Two pilot cohorts in 2015-16 and 2016-17 of eight students each year;
- Thapar is responsible for collecting the fees and transferring the funds to Trinity in two instalments per annum;
- A scholarship will be applied to the fee rate when the guaranteed number of students is reached;
- Two full professors will be employed by Trinity who will spend a minimum of 30% of their time in each institution;
- The provision of academic governance, quality assurance and CAPSL expertise are all covered in the proposal. Consultancy services provided to Thapar will be charged in line with consultancy rates;

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

- The Thapar Steering Group, and the Student Integration sub-group, will have responsibility for overseeing the implementation of the partnership.

The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer informed the Board that the partnership proposal will be considered in full by the Finance Committee at the meeting of 7 May 2016. The Finance Committee will assess the capacity of Trinity to deliver the partnership and conduct a high-level due diligence assessment of Thapar University. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer noted that the professorships are full-time posts and that Schools have included the mainstreaming of these posts in their School Strategic Plans. The Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer stated that further discussions with Human Resources will ensure that the contracts are linked to the funding.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-President for Global Relations confirmed that allowing for students to fail an exam, and thus not return to complete their degree, has been factored into the financial modelling of the partnership.

In response to a query from a Board member, the Vice-President for Global Relations confirmed that the two Professor posts will be contracted to the full range administrative, teaching and research tasks.

The Provost stated that the Professorships will cease to be referred to as a 'Thapar Professor' if the external funding ceases. This clause is to be included in the partnership agreement.

In response to a query from a Board member, who questioned why the partnership agreement references UK law, the Secretary to the College informed the Board members that it is standard practice to refer to a neutral, but comparable, legal framework when two competing jurisdictions are involved.

Professor McGilp asked that the risk register be updated to include mitigation measures prior to submission to Finance Committee, especially in relation to risks 18, 22 and 23.

The Vice-President for Global Relations is to submit the partnership proposal to Finance Committee. The partnership proposal will then return to Board for noting.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 20 April 2016, from the Vice-President for Global Relations, regarding the Thapar University Partnership - Engineering, Computer Science and Trinity Teaching & Learning.

The Provost thanked the Vice-President for Global Relations and the Global Relations Office for their hard work in securing the partnership with Thapar University.

BD/15-16/245

Gender and Trinity Staff: Trends in Populations, Recruitment and Progression

The Provost welcomed Ms. Aoife Crawford, Equality Officer, who joined the meeting for this item.

Professor Catherine McCabe, Chair of the Equality Committee, informed the Board that the report, as circulated, is an expansion of the 'Gender Differences in Academic Careers at Trinity' report reviewed by Board on 17 June 2015 (BD/14-15/283), and is compiled in accordance with the recommendations made at that meeting:

"[...] the report should be expanded to include data for those on Administrative, Technical and Library staff grades. Consideration is also to be given to staff retention; gender issues pertaining to all staff; and national and international benchmarking."

Professor McCabe asked the Board, based on the data presented in the report, to consider any possible actions that it may be appropriate for the University to take.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Equality Officer introduced the report document outlining the following key findings under populations, recruitment and progression:

- The population data depicts a workforce in which gender imbalance exists, reflecting traditional gender norms and strong cultural influences;
- A similar imbalance can be observed throughout the Irish and UK higher education sector;
- The data analysed suggest a very gradual trend towards increasing gender parity in most areas;
- No evidence has been found of a gender difference in applicant success rates in any of the progression processes analysed;
- Where low female application rates have been identified in academic progression and promotions, qualitative research to identify any negative factors is recommended;
- A review of data monitoring practices will be undertaken by the Equality Office in the light of the data gaps highlighted in the report.

The following comments from Board members were noted:

- Several of the Board members welcomed the report as timely and comprehensive;
- The findings of the report, while not unexpected, are a little disappointing, especially in relation to gender imbalance at senior management level in both the academic and administrative streams;
- Female students should be encouraged to consider a career in the Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics (STEM) areas where women are under-represented;
- Collecting qualitative data to investigate reasons behind the low number of women applying for promotion/progression would be helpful to redressing the imbalance at the application stage. Reports collated by WISER/INTEGER may prove helpful in this regard.
- A perceived lack of transparency of the promotions and progressions system and a lack of appropriate role models may discourage applicants;
- Small changes, such as encouraging home grown female professors, increasing retention levels and mentoring for new staff, would help close the gender imbalance;
- Additional monitoring is required to fill the data gaps highlighted in the report, especially in relation to administrative, technical and support staff;
- The disparity in female-male representation at Executive Officer and at Senior Administrative grades is particularly striking;
- College should focus on education, awareness and communication to address any imbalances;
- The next step of agreeing what to do with the data is very important.

The Equality Officer thanked the Board members for their comments and useful advice, and will examine if future Equality Committee work can include qualitative studies in key areas of gender imbalance as highlighted by the report.

Professor McCabe informed the Board that the recruitment data showed a larger proportion of men applying for promotion but, as the success rate indicated there was no gender bias, the difference can be accounted for by issues which had arisen before the point of application. Encouragement at Discipline/School level may increase the number of number of female applicants. The Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer stated that WISER (now the Trinity Centre for Gender Equality and Leadership) in conjunction with the Schools, could act as an enhanced vehicle for enabling this cultural shift.

A Board member stated that many Administrative AO2 staff have not been eligible for promotion regularly for the last 7 years. A paper from the Director of HR will be presented to the Board meeting of 22 June 2016 that will provide a comprehensive overview of historic key staffing statistics and a strategic commentary on the implications of current workforce

strategies. Presentation of this paper will give the Board the opportunity to identify what further information it would find useful to support strategic workforce planning

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Equality Officer is to provide a separate report to Board on gender representation of staff by contract type, to distinguish between: adjunct and part-time staff, part-time and term-time staff, and permanent and contract part-time staff.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 15 March 2016, from the Chair of the Equality Committee, Professor Catherine McCabe, and the accompanying report on Gender and Trinity Staff: Trends in Populations, Recruitment and Progression.

The Provost thanked Professor McCabe, the Equality Officer and the Equality Committee for their hard work in compiling the report.

The Equality Officer left the meeting at this point.

BD/15-16/246 Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services [BD/15-16/170 (BD/14-15/128)] – Catering Updates

The Provost welcomed Mr Adrian Neilan, Commercial Director, and Ms Moira O'Brien, Catering Manager, who joined the meeting for this item.

Mr. Neilan drew Board's attention to the memorandum of 18 April 2016, as circulated, which provides an update on work taking place within the Catering Department.

Mr Neilan stated that the main campus catering service is operating in a city-centre location where remaining competitively priced can be a challenge. Despite growth in student and staff clientele, the turnover has remained relatively static. Mr Neilan highlighted several enhancements to the catering service, including:

- a dedicated email address for booking a place at Commons;
- enabling payment at Commons by cash, credit or TCard;
- streamlining the external catering service by appointing a number of preferred suppliers following a competitive tender process;
- The café in the School of Nursing and Midwifery, D'Olier St, has closed;
- Catering in Trinity facilities at St James's and Tallaght Hospitals is outsourced, with both cafés expanding their food range and undergoing refurbishment. Both cafes have received very positive feedback both from their customers and the School Administrator;
- Extended opening hours in the 1592 Restaurant has resulted in an expanded client base and an increase in the number of private function bookings;
- The Catering Department are currently developing a Trinity Irish Nights concept, as a unique offering for large corporate groups, conferences or tour groups.;
- The introduction of the TCard allows staff and students easier access to business in all catering outlets.

In response to comments from Board members, Mr Neilan confirmed that the Catering Department have a programme for upgrading catering facilities and are actively addressing environmental concerns, including extended opening hours and agreeing Service Level Agreements to increase cleaning frequency. Mr Neilan informed the Board that many outlets were never designed to be catering outlets, and their success is a credit to the Catering Department team. Mr Neilan confirmed that the Catering Department have input into the design of catering facilities in planned new buildings.

In response to a comment from a Board member, the Bursar confirmed that the design for the postgraduate and researcher areas in Stack B will incorporate breakout spaces. The Bursar also confirmed that students have access to the TBSI common areas, and that

negotiations with the Executive & Technical Director of TBSI and Mr Neilan on expanding such provisions are ongoing.

In response to a comment from a Board member, Ms. O'Brien agreed to continue to work with the Sports Centre, the Students' Union Shop and other outlets to increase participation in the TCard scheme.

In response to a comment from a Board member, Ms. O'Brien offered to meet outside of the meeting to discuss any further catering concerns in off-campus locations.

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 18 April 2016, from the Catering Manager, Ms Moira O'Brien and the Commercial Director, Mr Adrian Neilan, regarding the update on the Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services.

Professor O'Neill left the meeting at this point.

BD/15-16/247

Visitors

The Secretary to the College provided a verbal update to the Board of one recent appeal which had been considered by the Visitors.

The Board noted the verbal update from the Secretary to the College on this item in relation to a recent case heard by the Visitors and the related recommendations for implementation.

BD/15-16/248

University Council

The Board approved the draft Acta of the meeting of 13 April 2016.

BD/15-16/249

Any Other Urgent Business

There were no items of urgent business.

BD/15-16/250

Information Transportation Specification (ITS) Structured Cabling Plan

The Board noted and approved the memorandum, dated 20 April 2016, from the Director, IT Services, Mr John Murphy, and Head of IT Operations and Academic Services, IT Services, Dr Geoff Bradley, and the accompanying Information Transportation Specification (ITS) Structured Cabling Plan .

BD/15-16/251

Board Business

(i) Callover

The Board noted the Board Callover from the meeting of 23 March 2016.

(ii) Outcomes

The Board noted the Board Outcomes from the meeting of 23 March 2016.

BD/15-16/252

Audit Committee

Professor McGilp invited the Board's attention to particular minutes of relevance to Board members. He advised that minutes relating to Risk Management (AD/15-16/43) and the Report on Externally Contracted Services (AD/15-16/44) were discussed in further detail in the Audit Committee Annual Report to Board 2015/16 (BD/15-16/241).

Professor McGilp noted management's action on the Interim Controls over the Interim Workflow Process (AD/15-16/45) item, which were discussed previously at Board (BD/15-16/223).

Professor McGilp advised the Board that the Audit Committee welcomed the positive assurances from the Treasurer/Chief Financial Officer, who attended the March meeting, in relation to the FIS Implementation Follow-up Review – Update (AD/15-16/46). The Audit Committee agreed that it will review progress on this item at a future date.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Audit Committee meeting of 15 March 2016.

BD/15-16/253 Equality Committee

Professor Catherine McCabe, Chair of the Equality Committee, informed the Board that an the Equality Policy Implementation Plan, based on feedback received from the College community during the Equality Policy review in Michaelmas Term 2015, is currently being developed.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of the Equality Committee meeting of 16 March 2016.

BD/15-16/254 Library and Information Policy Committee

Professor Micheál Ó Siochrú, Chair of the Library and Information Policy Committee, invited the Board's attention to particular minutes of relevance to Board members.

Professor Ó Siochrú highlighted minute LIPC/15-16/27 Research Collections Reading Room update, and advised the Board that any material changes to a project, which is not in line with what was agreed at the Library and Information Policy Committee, should be returned to the Committee.

After discussion, it was agreed that the length of contract for the role of Keeper of Manuscripts and the Head of Research Collections (LIPC/15-16/28) will be agreed by the Executive Officers Group, before returning to Board for noting as a matter arising.

The Board noted and approved the draft minutes of Library and Information Policy Committee meeting of 15 February 2016.

SECTION C

BD/15-16/255 Board Elections 2016

The Board noted and approved a memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 18 April 2016.

BD/15-16/256 Higher Degrees

The Board noted Higher Degrees, circulated, approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 23 March and 13 April 2016.

BD/15-16/257 Proctors' Lists for Commencements

The Board noted that the Proctors' Lists were approved by the sub-committee of Board and Council on 29 March 2016.

BD/15-16/258 Scholarship – Requests for Intermission

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Dean of Graduate Studies, circulated, dated 4 April 2016.

BD/15-16/259 Heads of School Elections

(i) Head of School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology (2016-2019)

The Board noted that Professor Siobhán Garrigan had been elected to the Head of School of Religions, Peace Studies and Theology with effect from 1 July 2016.

(ii) Head of School of Psychology (2016-2017)

The Board noted that Professor David Hevey had been elected to the Head of School of Psychology with effect from 1 July 2016.

BD/15-16/260 Schedule of Board and Council Meetings – 2016-2017

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 6 April 2016.

Incorporating any amendments approved at subsequent Board meetings

BD/15-16/261 Almanack 2016-17 term dates

The Board noted the memorandum from the Editor of the Calendar, Office of the College Secretary, circulated, dated 19 April 2016.

BD/15-16/262 Changes to the online Trinity Calendar

The Board noted the memorandum from the Secretary to the College, circulated, dated 19 April 2016.

BD/15-16/263 Existing Relationships with Israeli and Palestinian Institutions

The Board noted the memorandum from the Academic Secretary, circulated, dated 4 April 2016.

BD/15-16/264 Trinity Centre for Gender Equality and Leadership

The Board noted and approved the memorandum from the Vice-Provost/Chief Academic Officer, circulated, dated 15 April 2016.

BD/15-16/265 Sealings

The Board noted the sealings, as circulated, and attached as Appendix 1 to this Minute

BD/15-16/266 Implementation Plan for Accommodation and Catering Services [BD/15-16/170 (BD/14-15/128)] – Catering Updates

The Board noted the memorandum from the Catering Manager, Ms Moira O'Brien, and the Commercial Director, Mr Adrian Neilan, circulated, dated 18 April 2016.

BD/15-16/267 Board Meeting of 22 June 2016 – Attendance of incoming SU/GSU representatives

The Board noted and approved the attendance of incoming SU/GSU representatives as observers at the last meeting of Board.

BD/15-16/268 Corporate Services Division – Corporate Report 2014/15

It was agreed that the Human Resources element of the 'CSD by Numbers' on page 4 of the draft report would be reviewed and revised.

The Board noted the report, as circulated.

SECTION D

In compliance with the Data Protection Acts this information is restricted.

Signed:

Date:

Sealings

24 March 2016

**The College, and (1) Dr Dirk Ippen and William K Nolan (as landlord), (2) Allied Irish Bank PLC
Licence to assign Leasehold Interest in Stack B, IFSC, Dublin 1**

The Seal of the College was put in triplicate to a Licence Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars and the other members of the Board of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, and Dr Dirk Ippen and William K. Nowlan, and Allied Irish Banks PLC to assign leasehold interest in Stack B, IFSC, Dublin 1.

24 March 2016

**Allied Irish Bank PLC
Land Registry – Folio 86065L**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate to a Leasehold Agreement between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars and the other members of the Board of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin, and Allied Irish Banks PLC.

30 March 2016

**National University of Ireland Galway
Licence in connection with the business of High End Computing**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate for Licence between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and National University of Ireland, Galway, in connection with the business of high end computing as carried on by the Licensee and all ancillary uses arising thereunder, and the premises of The Seventh Floor of the Tower, Trinity Technology & Enterprise Campus, Pearse Street, Dublin 2.

30 March 2016

**Virtual Access Ireland Ltd
Licence in connection with the design and manufacture of IT Service provider Solutions**

The Seal of the College was put in duplicate for Licence between the Provost, Fellows, Foundation Scholars, and the other members of Board, of the College of the Holy and Undivided Trinity of Queen Elizabeth near Dublin and Virtual Access Ltd in connection with the design and manufacture of IT Service provider Solutions as carried on by the Licensee and the premises known as Unit 15 Trinity Technology & Enterprise Campus, Pearse Street, Dublin 2.